

201-5

BUREAU OF MUNICIPAL RESEARCH

TORONTO'S CITIZENS CAN CONTROL TORONTO'S AFFAIRS ONLY THROUGH FREQUENT, PROMPT, ACCURATE AND PERTINENT INFORMATION WITH REGARD TO TORONTO'S BUSINESS

137 WELLINGTON ST. W.
TELEPHONE EL. 1904



TORONTO,
CANADA

White Paper No. 316

November 14th, 1947

PERSONNEL MANAGEMENT IN THE MUNICIPAL CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF TORONTO (This does not include the School Boards)

On May 29th, 1945, the City Council of Toronto passed a by-law, amended on June 24th, 1947, requiring the appointment of a Personnel Director and an Advisory Personnel Committee. This by-law was implemented. Thus for the first time the City had a permanent personnel organization, having functions as to the appointment, promotion and classification of all employees in the Civic Service except those of the Police Department and the heads of departments and their deputies. The theory underlying the setting up of a personnel organization is that the various departmental staffs are parts of a unitary Civic Staff with not sixteen but one employer, the Corporation of the City of Toronto. This in itself is a great step ahead and goes far to prevent departments from becoming compartments, which is so fatally easy.

Central Civic Employment Registry

The Director must establish and has established a Central Civic Employment Registry and within it a nominal roll of employees, showing in each case classification, title of position, salary or rate of pay, details of service and other relevant facts.

The Civic Survey by an independent body in 1913, the report of which was published in 1914 by the Bureau of Municipal Research, contains the following paragraph:

"Need for Establishing a Civil List.

Control over lump fund appropriations for salaries and wages should still further be exercised through establishing a **civil list by central authority**. This should be prepared by the Board of Control, arranged by classes and grades of service, as well as by departments, and submitted to the council for approval. A recapitulation and summary should accompany the civil list showing the totals for each class, grade and rate of pay for the entire city. In approving such a list the condition should be attached that **the Board of Control would have power to shift from one department to another any person within the list, so that his services might be used to the best advantage by the city, being limited only by the amount of salaries and wages which could be paid.**"

The Bureau has pressed the matter many times since. For example its White Paper, 69, 1923, on the City as an Employer contained the following queries, which can now, or soon, be answered in the affirmative:

"Are employees invariably taken on the various staffs after a careful inquiry as to their training and fitness for the positions to be occupied?"

Are all promotions made according to merit and all increases given after a careful inquiry into service records, or are increases sometimes given to groups whose claims are strenuously pressed and at times in the year when a careful consideration of the needs of all departments is out of the question?"

Are transfers from one department to another customary and easy, either temporarily to help out one department when it is working under pressure, while another is not, or permanently to better paying positions as a reward for service, and a stimulus to ambition?"

Is adequate attention given to placing misfits in one department in positions in another department for which they are better fitted?"

Is any person or body responsible for devising means for the best use of the civic personnel as a whole and for continuous study connected therewith, and, if so, is the work actually being done?"

How much the city has lost by not having a personnel department for the last third of a century cannot be estimated; but the important thing for present tax payers is that one has at last been established, controlling the appointment, promotion and classification of some 6,100 to 6,500 civic employees.

The procedure followed in the making of any appointment or in any promotion is:

- 1 A requisition on the Personnel Director from the head of the department concerned.
- 2 Investigation by the Personnel Director and, if a new position is involved, report by him to the Advisory Personnel Committee.
- 3 Report to the Personnel Director by the Advisory Personnel Committee.
- 4 Forwarding of this report and its recommendations to the Board of Control together with his comments thereon.
- 5 The forwarding of three names (where the merit lists have been applied) by the Personnel Director to the department head (The merit system is being put into effect progressively and, during the transition period, the position involved is advertised throughout the entire service to permit any employee in any department to apply.)
- 6 The selection of one of these three (or from those who reply in response to advertisements where the merit system is not yet in force) by the department head or failing this an explanation of why none is suitable.

The Advisory Personnel Committee, which is also a board of appeal as to administration of rules and regulations, is made up of

- 1 A representative of the Board of Control.
- 2 One representative each of Locals 79, 113 and 43, nominated by them and appointed by the civic administration.
- 3 Three department heads nominated by all department heads and appointed by the civic administration.

Local 79 is made up of all inside employees and those outside who have reached the rank of foreman.

Local 113 consists of all employees of the Fire Department.

Local 43 consists of all outside employees except those who have reached the rank of foreman.

The Corporation and these unions have contracts. Under these contracts, the City has established union shops in the outside service, the inside service and the Fire Department. This means that all old and new employees except heads of department, deputy heads and certain executive and professional employees must become members of the union. It also means that any citizen of the Corporation, who shares the cost of the salaries and wages paid by the Corporation, cannot work for the Corporation in which he is part owner—and therefore a shareholder—unless he believes in the union shop or is willing to sink his beliefs by signing a statement that he will become a member of the union concerned.

The unions have been granted also a voluntary check off. In practice almost or quite 100% of the employees have signed requests that their union fees be deducted from their salaries by the Finance Department. This is not important from the standpoint of cost as there are several other deductions now and little or no additional staff is required. It is the natural corollary of the union shop which, as has been pointed out, involves an element of serious injustice to a large element of the electorate. It would appear that the voters as a whole should have been given a chance to vote on the question of the establishment of the Union Shop.

The Union shop is the only serious fault in the personnel set-up. The Department of Personnel and the Advisory Committee on Personnel seem to be functioning well. As a result, department heads have lost some powers in the interest of the civic staff as a whole; but they are, in the main at least, given every possible consideration and in time no doubt the new order of things will be taken as a matter of course. The establishment of a Personnel Division provides the various departments with an overhead service in that it procures applicants and screens them before referring them for possible employment.

Just as the establishment of centralized purchasing was necessary to get full value for the, say, \$7,000,000 spent annually on supplies, equipment etc., so centralized personnel administration is necessary to get full value from the say, \$12,000,000 spent annually for the services of persons.

In the Labour Gazette of March, 1945, the Dominion Government's Policy on labour relations is stated. Paragraph 3 reads:

"Broadly speaking, except where provision is made for preferential treatment, as in the case of war veterans with overseas service, all citizens of Canada have equal rights in the matter of employment in government undertakings. As Crown companies are owned by the public, their directors are expected to be careful to see that no provision is included which would create discrimination as between one employee and another, or which would have the effect of excluding any citizen from employment therein because he does not belong to a particular union."

It would appear that directors of Municipal Corporations should be similarly bound. They represent all the people within their limits just as the Dominion Government represents all the people within its limits.

The table attached shows: 1 Just how the personnel bill has steadily risen. 2 That until recently "other services" have been starved.

To get the full value of the services of persons, care must be exercised to see that sufficient supplies and equipment are available for them, otherwise it may be necessary to reduce the force, which, in turn may work a hardship on employees. While the Corporation does not exist simply to give employment, persons, when engaged, should be advised as to the probable length of their service and should, of course, be given reasonable notice before being laid off or discharged for reasons for which they are not responsible.

A COMPARATIVE STATEMENT OF THE EXPENDITURES OF THE CITY AND THE SCHOOL BOARDS
BASED ON CIVIC ESTIMATES

	1947	1946	1945	1944	1943	1942	1941	1940	1939	1938
	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$
Estimated Cost of Salaries, Wages and Other Payments for the services of persons.....	25,790,729	23,796,625	21,394,759	20,436,511	19,262,552	18,321,616	18,238,793	18,528,752	18,837,148	18,978,635
Per Capita (of population) cost of personal services.....	36.58	34.16	31.38	30.19	28.57	27.38	27.81	28.59	29.02	29.30
Per cent that personal services are of total cost.....	58.7%	60.6%	59.2%	58.4%	56.6%	53.5%	52.3%	52.1%	51.6%	51.2%
Estimated cost of Other Services*.....	12,649,377	9,637,927	8,631,296	7,729,058	7,947,282	7,709,632	7,503,512	6,580,123	6,557,441	7,562,143
Per Capita cost of Other Services.....	17.94	13.84	12.66	11.42	11.79	11.52	11.44	10.15	10.10	11.67
Per cent that "Other Costs" are of total costs.....	28.8%	24.5%	23.9%	22.1%	23.3%	22.5%	21.5%	18.5%	17.9%	20.4%
Per Capita amount of Appropriations.....	62.36	56.33	53.00	51.66	50.49	51.13	53.17	54.90	56.26	57.18
Per cent of total Expenditures which goes to salaries and wages and other payments for personal services....	49.0%	40.5%	40.3%	37.8%	41.2%	42.1%	41.1%	35.5%	34.8%	39.8%
Population.....	705,000	696,555	681,802	676,887	674,285	669,130	655,751	648,098	649,123	647,803

* Not including welfare expenditures from government grants to make figures substantially comparable.